

НЕПРИМИРЕННІ НАРАТИВИ «ПРО ІНШОГО»: ВИВЧЕННЯ ПАМ'ЯТІ ПРО ЗБРОЙНИЙ КОНФЛІКТ У ЧЕЧНІ

Євгенія Горюшина

Федеральний дослідний центр Південний науковий центр РАН
ORCID: 0000-0003-1800-9890

<https://doi.org/10.36169/2227-6068.2020.01.00022>

Анотація. *Внутрішній збройний конфлікт у Чечні досі залишається одним з найбільш політизованих і, отже, складних для вивчення пам'яті про нього. Стаття заснована на узагальненні зібраних автором 38 інтерв'ю з очевидцями і учасниками двох етапів бойових дій 1994–1996 рр. і 1999–2009 рр. за останні три роки польових досліджень в Ростовській і Московській областях, Чеченській Республіці та сусідніх регіонах Кавказу. З етичних міркувань зберігається анонімність всіх респондентів, за погодженням з респондентами публікуються тільки незначні уривки інтерв'ю, що характеризують ключові моменти спогадів про конфлікт. Також цю статтю запропоновано аналіз історіографії англомовних і російськомовних досліджень зі взаємозв'язку пам'яті і конфлікту, в тому числі наведено найбільш значущі роботи з вивчення чеченського конфлікту.*

Авторка починала роботу з припущення, що розказана історія здатна примирити ворожі наративи, але дослідження демонструє протилежне — збереження міфологізованих інтерпретацій минулого, які призводять до зловживань пам'яттю і конструювання «Іншого», навіть зовнішнього образу ворога у війні. У статті затверджується, що пам'ять про чеченському внутрішньому воєнному конфлікту тесним чином переплетена з пам'яттю про Велику Отчественной війні, яка виявилася востребованою політичною елітою в 2000-х рр. У цей період у Росії починає формуватися політика перемоги, що стала інструментом зміни курсу зовнішньої політики, в результаті якої відбувся перехід від локальних конфліктів до більш масштабних війн за межами країни.

Ключові слова: *Чечня, конфлікт, історична пам'ять, інтерв'ю, політика перемоги*

Повнотекстова версія статті доступна російською мовою.

Бібліографія:

- Achkasov, Valerij. (2013). "Politika pamjati" kak instrument stroitel'stva postsocialisticheskikh nacij [from Rus.: "Politics of memory" as an instrument for building post-socialist nations]. *Zhurnal sociologii i social'noj antropologii* 16(4): 106–123.
- Ashplant, Timothy G., Dawson, Graham, Roper, Michael. (2017). The politics of war memory and commemoration: contexts, structures and dynamics. *Commemorating War*. London: Routledge, 3–86.
- Assman, Alejda. (2019). *Zabvenie istorii – odezhimost' istoriej* [from Rus.: Oblivion of history – obsession with history.]. Moskva: Novoe literaturnoe obozrenie.
- Banner F. (2006). Uncivil wars: 'Suicide bomber identity' as a product of Russo-Chechen conflict. *Religion, State & Society* 34(3): 215–253.
- Bernhard, Michael H., Kubik, Jan (ed.). (2016). *Twenty years after communism: The politics of memory and commemoration*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bernstein, Seth. (2016). Remembering war, remaining Soviet: digital commemoration of World War II in Putin's Russia. *Memory Studies* 9(4): 422–436.
- Bodnar, John E. (1991). *Remaking America: Public Memory, Commemoration, and Patriotism in the twentieth century*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Bol'shoj Kavkaz. (2013). «Diskriminacionnaja kompensacija dlja russkikh iz Chechni». Interv'ju zamestitelja predsedatelja asociacii bezhencev iz Chechni «Sootechestvennik» O. Makoveeva [from Rus.: "Discrimination against Russians from Chechnya". Interview with the Deputy Chairman of the Association of Refugees from Chechnya "Compatriot" O. Makoveev] *Bol'shoj Kavkaz*, 18 July, <http://www.bigcaucasus.com/review/interview/18-06-2013/83757-makoveev-0/> (accessed 21 January 2020)
- Bordjugov, Gennadij (ed.). (2015). *Pobeda-70: rekonstrukcija jubileja* [from Rus.: Victory-70: reconstruction of the anniversary]. Moskva: AIRO-XXI.
- Boutros-Ghali, Boutros. (1992). An agenda for peace: Preventive diplomacy, peacemaking and peace-keeping. *International Relations* 11(3): 201–218.
- Burganova, Larisa, Kornilov, Petr. (2003). Rekonstruirovanie struktury obraza voennogo konflikta (po materialam SMI) [from Rus.: Reconstructing the image structure of a military conflict (based on media sources)]. *Sociologicheskie issledovanija* 6: 56–63.
- Cairns, Ed, Roe, Michael. (2003). *Role of Memory in Ethnic Conflict*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Campana, Aurélie. (2012). The Chechen memory of deportation: from recalling a silenced past to the political use of public memory. *Public Memory, Public Media and the Politics of Justice*. London: Palgrave Macmillan: 41–162.
- Cornell S. The War Against Terrorism and the Conflict in Chechnya: A Case for Distinction. In: *Fletcher Forum of World Affairs*, Vol. 27, no 2, p. 167–184.
- Danilova, Natal'ja. (2005). Memorial'naja versija Afganskoj vojny (1979-1989 gody) [from Rus.: Memorial version of the Afghan war (1979-1989)]. *Neprikosnovennyj zapas* 2(3): 40-41.
- Danilova, Nataliya. (2014). Victims and heroes: commemorating the Russian military casualties in the Chechen conflicts. *Chechnya at War and Beyond*, London: Routledge, 58–75.
- Devine-Wright Patrick. (2003). A theoretical overview of memory and conflict. In *The Role of Memory in Ethnic Conflict*, Cairns, Ed & Roe, Michael (eds). London: Palgrave Macmillan, 9–33.
- Engelhardt, Tom. (2007). *The end of victory culture: Cold war America and the disillusioning of a generation*. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.

- Forum pereselencheskih organizacij. (2019). SPCh o merah gospodderzhki vynuzhdennym pereselencam iz Chechenskoj Respubliki. Mezhdunarodnoe obshhestvennoe dvizhenie sodejstvija migrantam i ih ob#edinenijam "Forum pereselencheskih organizacij" [from Rus.: HRC on measures of state support to internally displaced persons from the Chechen Republic. International Public Movement for Assistance to Migrants and Their Associations "Forum of Migration Organizations"]. *Forum pereselencheskih organizacij*, 3 August, <https://migrant.ru/vazhnoe-spch-o-merax-gospodderzhki-vynuzhdennym-pereselencam-iz-chechenskoj-respubliki/> (accessed 23 January 2020)
- Fussell, Paul. (1975). *The Great War and modern memory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gammer, Moshe. (2002). Nationalism and history: rewriting the Chechen national past. In *Secession, history and the social sciences*, Coppieters, Bruno, Michel Huyseune, Michel (eds.). VUB Brussels University Press: 117–140. <http://poli.vub.ac.be/publi/orderbooks/secession/secession-04.pdf> (accessed: 14 January 2020).
- Goryushina, Evgeniya (2019). Rjadovoj besslavnoj vojny: interv'ju s uchastnikom zimnego shturma Groznogo 1994 g. [from Rus.: A Private of the Inglorious War: an Interview with a Participant in the Winter Assault of the Grozny in 1994]. *Novoe proshloe/The New Past* 1: 238–268.
- Hölscher, Tonio. (2006). The transformation of victory into power: from event to structure. In *Representations of war in ancient Rome*, Dillon, Sheila, Welch, Katherine E. (eds.), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 27–48.
- Hutchings, Stephen, Rulyova, Natalia (2008). Commemorating the past/performing the present: Television coverage of the Second World War victory celebrations and the (de) construction of Russian nationhood. *The Post-Soviet Russian Media*. London: Routledge, 153–172.
- Irwin-Zarecka, Iwona. (2017). *Frames of remembrance: The dynamics of collective memory*. London: Routledge.
- Ivanov, Aleksandr et al. (2003). Psihologicheskie posledstvija uchastija voennosluzhashhih v boevyh dejstvijah v Chechenskoj respublike i ih mediko-psihologo-social'naja korekcija [from Rus.: The psychological consequences of the participation of military personnel in hostilities in the Chechen Republic and their medical, psychological and social correction.]. *Konsul'tativnaja psihologija i psihoterapija* 11(4): 146–162.
- Izvestija. (2008). V Chechne vozobnovljajutsja vyplaty za utrachennoe v hode vojny zhil'e i imushhestvo [from Rus.: Payments for housing and property lost during the war resume in Chechnya]. *Izvestija*, 23 January, <https://iz.ru/news/416935> (accessed 22 January 2020)
- Jensen, Sune Qvotrup. (2011). Othering, identity formation and agency. *Qualitative studies* 2(2):63–78.
- Kansteiner, Wolf. (2002). Finding meaning in memory: A methodological critique of collective memory studies. *History and theory* 41(2): 179–197.
- Köllner, Tobias. (2013). Ritual and commemoration in contemporary Russia: State-church relationships and the vernacularization of the politics of memory. *Focaal* 67: 61–73.
- Kommersant Vlast'. (1999). Pobeda za gorami [from Rus.: Victory is not just around the corner]. *Kommersant# Vlast'* 42, 26 October victory is just around the corner <https://www.kommersant.ru/doc/16083> (accessed 23 January 2020)
- Lawson, Stephanie, Tannaka, Seiko. (2011). War memories and Japan's 'normalization' as an international actor: A critical analysis. *European Journal of International Relations*. 17(3): 405–428.
- Lenta.Ru. (2015). «Esli Rossija oslabnet, to zapylaet ves' Kavkaz». Interv'ju S. Shahraja [from Rus.: "If Russia weakens, the whole Caucasus will burn." Interview S. Shakhrai]. *Lenta.Ru*, 24 December, <https://lenta.ru/articles/2015/12/24/shahrai/> (accessed 26 January 2020)
- Lieven, Anatol. (2000). Nightmare in the Caucasus. *Washington Quarterly* 23(1): 145–159.

- Liu, James H., et al. (2009). Representing world history in the 21st century: The impact of 9/11, the Iraq war, and the nation-state on dynamics of collective remembering. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology* 40(4): 667–692.
- Maercker, Andreas, et al. (2009). Is acknowledgment of trauma a protective factor? The sample case of refugees from Chechnya. *European Psychologist* 14(3): 249–254.
- Malishevskij, Nikolaj. (2015). Anglojazychnaja istoriografija vooruzhjonogo konflikta v Chechne [from Rus.: The English-language historiography of the armed conflict in Chechnya]. *Problemy nacional'noj strategii* 5: 224–249.
- Monaghan, Andrew. (2008). 'An enemy at the gates' or 'from victory to victory'? Russian foreign policy. *International Affairs* 84(4): 717–733.
- Nemeth, William J. (2002). *Future war and Chechnya: a case for hybrid warfare*: thesis. Monterey, California. Naval Postgraduate School.
- Obradović, Sandra. (2016). Don't forget to remember: Collective memory of the Yugoslav wars in present-day Serbia. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology* 22(1): 12–18.
- Olick, Jeffrey K., Robbins, Joyce. (1998). Social memory studies: From "collective memory" to the historical sociology of mnemonic practices. *Annual Review of sociology* 24(1): 105–140.
- Osmaev, Abbas. (2010). Obshhestvenno-politicheskaja i povsednevnaja zhizn' Chechenskoj Respubliki v 1996-2005 gg.: dis. – avtoreferat dissertacii [from Rus.: Socio-political and everyday life of the Chechen Republic in 1996-2005: dis. – doctor dissertation abstract]. Mahachkala.
- Paez, Dario, H. Liu, James H. (2011). Collective memory of conflicts. *Intergroup conflicts and their resolution: A social psychological perspective* 105–124.
- Ram, Harsha. (1999). *Prisoners of the Caucasus: Literary myths and media representations of the Chechen conflict*. Berkeley: University of California.
- Rosbalt. (2014). "Tam my russkie, zdes' – chechency" [from Rus.: "There we are Russians, here are the Chechens"]. Rosbalt, 20 January, <https://www.rosbalt.ru/piter/2014/01/20/1223315.html> (accessed 22 January 2020)
- Rostovcev, Evgenij, Sosnickij, Dmitrij. (2014). Napravlenija issledovanij istoricheskoi pamjati v Rossii [from Rus.: Research directions of historical memory in Russia]. *Vestnik Sankt-Peterburgskogo universiteta. Istorija* 2: 106–126.
- Russell, John. (2005). Terrorists, bandits, spooks and thieves: Russian demonisation of the Chechens before and since 9/11. *Third World Quarterly* 26(1):101–116.
- Sachs, Jonah. (2012). *Winning the story wars: Why those who tell (and live) the best stories will rule the future*. Boston: Harvard Business Press.
- Savin, Sergey, Kasabutskaya, Margarita. (2019). Historical Memory of Ethno-Confessional Conflicts in Russia. *Vestnik Sankt-Peterburgskogo universiteta. Istorija* 64 (3): 1097–1113.
- Schuman, Howard, Scott, Jacqueline. Generations and collective memories. *American sociological review* 359–381.
- Senjavskij, Aleksandr, Senjavskaja, Elena. (2009). Vtoraja mirovaja vojna i istoricheskaja pamjat': obraz proshlogo v kontekste sovremennoj geopolitiki [from Rus.: World War II and historical memory: the image of the past in the context of modern geopolitics]. *Vestnik MGIMO Universiteta*. 4: 1–32.
- Severnyj Kavkaz v sostave Rossijskoj imperii. (2007). Bobrovnikov, Vladimir et al. (eds.) Moskva: Novoe literaturnoe obozrenie.
- Shnirelman, Viktor. (2006). A revolt of social memory: the Chechens and Ingush against the Soviet historians. *Reconstruction and interaction of Slavic Eurasia and its neighboring worlds*: 273–307.

- Shnirelman, Viktor. (2016). Social'naja pamjat' i obrazy proshlogo [from Rus.: Social memory and images of the past]. *Novoe proshloe /The New Past* 1:100–129.
- Shurmina, Natal'ja. (2019). Aleksej Miller – o sovremennyh tendencijah v politike pamjati [from Rus.: Alexey Miller – about current trends in the politics of memory]. *Prezidentskij centr Borisa El'cina* [from Rus. Presidential Center of Boris Yeltsin], 25 October, <https://yeltsin.ru/news/aleksej-miller-o-sovremennyh-tendenciyah-v-politike-pamyati/> (accessed 10 January 2020).
- Sikevich, Zinaida. (2017). Jetnicheskaja identichnost' ruskikh i chechencev v kontekste istoricheskoy pamjati (sravnitel'nyj analiz) [from Rus.: Ethnic identity of Russians and Chechens in the context of historical memory (comparative analysis)]. *Vlast'* 2:122–129.
- Simunovic, Pjer. (1998). The Russian military in Chechnya – A case study of morale in war. *The Journal of Slavic Military Studies* 11(1): 63–95.
- Sokirianskaia E. (2007). Ideology and conflict: Chechen political nationalism prior to, and during, ten years of war. *Ethno-Nationalism, Islam and the State in the Caucasus*, London: Routledge, 120–156.
- Souleimanov, Emil, Ditrych, Emil, Ondrej. (2008). The internationalisation of the Russian–Chechen conflict: myths and reality. *Europe-Asia Studies* 60(7): 1199–1222.
- Spillman, Lynette P. (1997). *Nation and Commemoration: Creating National Identities in the United States and Australia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Strel'nikova, Anna. (2011). Kollektivnaja pamjat' v gorodskom prostranstve: mesta pamjati ob Afganskoj vojne. [from Rus.: Collective memory in urban space: places of memory of the Afghan war]. *Interakcija. Interv'ju. Interpretacija* 5(6): 118–125
- Svjatoslavskij, Aleksej. (2013). *Istorija Rossii v zerkale pamjati. Mehanizmy formirovanija istoricheskikh obrazov* [from Rus.: The history of Russia in the mirror of memory. Mechanisms for the formation of historical images] Moskva: Drevlehranilishhe.
- The Economist. (2000). Are foreigners fighting there? *The Economist*, 6 July, <https://www.economist.com/europe/2000/07/06/are-foreigners-fighting-there> (accessed 13 February 2020)
- The New York Times. (2001). War on Terror Casts Chechen Conflict in a New Light. *The New York Times*, 9 December, <https://www.nytimes.com/2001/12/09/world/war-on-terror-casts-chechen-conflict-in-a-new-light.html> (accessed 12 February 2020)
- The Washington Post. (1999). Muslims From Afar Join Fight in Chechnya. *The Washington Post*, 12 October, <https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/1999/10/12/muslims-from-afar-join-fight-in-chechnya/3e274d3c-3bb1-4c71-8086-bfd5a0af128c/> (accessed 12 February 2020)
- Tishkov, Valerij. (2001). *Obshhestvo v vooruzhennom konflikte (jetnografija chechenskoj vojny)* [from Rus.: Society in armed conflict (ethnography of the Chechen war)]. Moskva: Nauka.
- Tishkov, Valerij. (2008). Jetnografija chechenskoj vojny [from Rus.: Ethnography of the Chechen war]. *Rossija i musul'manskij mir* [from Rus.: Russia and the Muslim world] 3: 63–81.
- Tiskhov, Valerij. (2004). *Chechnya: Life in a War-Torn Society* (California Series in Public Anthropology). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Vesti.Ru (2013). President Putin compared the Nazis with the terrorists. *Vesti.Ru*, 2 February, <https://www.vesti.ru/doc.html?id=19606&tid=12087> (accessed 18 January 2020).
- Wagoner, Brady, Brescó, Ignacio. (2016). Conflict and memory: The past in the present. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology* 22(1): 3–4.
- Wertsch J. V. et al. (2002). *Voices of collective remembering*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wertsch, James V. (2008). Blank spots in collective memory: A case study of Russia. *The annals of the American academy of political and social science* 617(1): 58–71.

- Williams, Brian Glyn. (2000). Commemorating “the deportation” in post-Soviet Chechnya: the role of memorialization and collective memory in the 1994-1996 and 1999-2000 Russo-Chechen Wars. *History & Memory* 12(1): 101–134.
- Winter, Jay Murray. (2006). *Remembering war: The Great War between memory and history in the twentieth century*. New Heaven: Yale University Press.
- Wood, Elizabeth A. (2011). Performing memory: Vladimir Putin and the celebration of World War II in Russia. *The Soviet and Post-Soviet Review* 38(2):172–200.