

ДАЛЕКИЕ ДРУЗЬЯ, БЛИЗКИЕ ВРАГИ? НЕОДНОЗНАЧНОСТЬ ГРУЗИНСКИХ ДРУГИХ

Петра Колморген

Европейский университет Виадрина)

ORCID: 0000-0002-6030-6760

<https://doi.org/10.36169/2227-6068.2020.01.00015>

Аннотация. Грузия вынуждена искать друзей далеко, поскольку рассматривает своих ближайших соседей как довольно враждебных по отношению к себе. Для южно-кавказской страны это недружественное окружение проявляется в отношении к двум своим могущественным соседям. Образы России и Турции сконструированы таким образом, чтобы подчеркнуть их инаковость по отношению к двум ключевым маркерам грузинской идентичности – западности и православности. При этом представления о Себе и Других не всегда негативны и направлены не только вовне. С одной стороны, грузинское конструирование Другого в образах России и Турции остается неполным, так как соседи отчасти обладают характеристиками, близкими к специфике грузинского Я. С другой стороны, создание Другого происходит и в пределах грузинских государственных границ – в Аджарии, а также в Южной Осетии и Абхазии, поскольку на этих территориях оспариваются православие и западность как параметры грузинской идентичности. Анализируя эти сложные связи, автор рассматривает, как образы России и Турции могут одновременно содержать элементы подобия с грузинскостью и отличия от нее. Кроме того, в статье рассматривается, как происходит создание Другого в пределах самой Грузии. Среди прочего, Аджария, Южная Осетия и Абхазия воспринимаются как недостаточно православные или западные.

Главный вывод статьи заключается в том, что объяснение неоднозначности образов Других в Грузии может быть найдено в имманентных конфликтах внутри самой грузинской идентичности. Ключом не только к пониманию нынешней идентичности Грузии, но и к контекстуализации отношений с Россией, Турцией, Южной Осетией, Абхазией и Аджарией является то, как именно формируется грузинская идентичность между полюсами западности и православия, и тем, насколько западность совместима с грузинской православностью и в какой степени православие может быть частью грузинской западности.

Ключевые слова: южный Кавказ, идентичность, Другой, конструирование образа Другого, православность, западность, исламофобия, международная политика Грузии, Россия, Турция

Полнотекстовая версия статьи доступна на английском языке.

Библиография:

- Abushov, Kavus. (2009). Policing the Near Abroad: Russian foreign policy in the South Caucasus. *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 63(2): 187–212.
- Association Implementation Report on Georgia*. (2016. Brussels: High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy.
- Atlantic Council. (2010). Saakashvili, Mikheil (Transcript), <https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/commentary/transcript/saakashvili-mikheil-4-15-2010> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Beacháin, Donnacha Ó. & Coene, Frederik. (2014). Go West: Georgia's European identity and its role in domestic politics and foreign policy objectives. *Nationalities Papers* 42(6): 923–41.
- Blakkisrud, Helge & Kolstø, Pål. (2012). Dynamics of de facto statehood: the South Caucasian de facto states between secession and sovereignty. *Southeast European and Black Sea Studies* 12(2): 281–98.
- Brons, Lajos. (2015). Othering, an Analysis. *Transcience, a Journal of Global Studies* 6(1): 69–90.
- Buzogány, Aron. (2019). Europe, Russia, or both? Popular perspectives on overlapping regionalism in the Southern Caucasus. *East European Politics* 35(1): 93–109.
- Cecire, Michael H. (2013). The Merchant Hegemon: Georgia's role in Turkey's Caucasus system. In *Georgian foreign policy. The quest for sustainable security*, Kakachia, Kornely & Cecire, Michael H. (eds). Tbilisi: Konrad Adenauer Stiftung, 111–24.
- Chedia, Beka. (2012). *Georgia: religious affairs pervaded with fear of Turkey's influence*, <http://www.eastbook.eu/en/2012/03/18/georgia-religious-affairs-pervaded-with-fear-of-turkeys-influence/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Chikovani, Nino. (2005). A United Caucasus: Reality Rooted in the Past or High-Flown Political Illusions? *Central Asia and the Caucasus* 35(5): 45-54.
- Civil.ge. (2019). *First Ever Impromptu Pride Parade Held in Tbilisi*, <https://civil.ge/archives/312596> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Civil.ge. (2005a). *Building the Case*, <https://civil.ge/archives/107150> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Civil.ge. (2005b). *Saakashvili Focuses on Human Rights in Abkhazia in Talks with Annan*, <https://civil.ge/archives/109235> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Cooley, Alexander. (2017). *Whose rules, whose sphere? Russian governance and influence in post-Soviet states*, <https://carnegieendowment.org/2017/06/30/whose-rules-whose-sphere-russian-governance-and-influence-in-post-soviet-states-pub-71403> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Cornell, Svante E. (2014). *Getting Georgia right*. Brussels: Centre for European Studies.
- Cornell, Svante E. (2003). *Small nations and great powers: A study of ethnopolitical conflict in the Caucasus*. Richmond: Curzon.
- Delcour, Laure & Wolczuk, Kataryna. (2015). Spoiler or facilitator of democratization?: Russia's role in Georgia and Ukraine. *Democratization* 22(3): 459–78.
- Di Puppò, Lili. (2019). *Policing as Spectacle in Georgia: The Creation of Boundaries in a Post-Revolutionary Country*. Moscow: National Research University Higher School of Economics.
- Gamkrelidze, Tamar. (2019). The project of Europe: a robust attempt to redefine Georgian identity. *East European Politics* 35(3): 351–71.

- Georgian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. (2000). *Georgia and the world: A vision and strategy for the future*, <http://www.bits.de/NRANEU/docs/CFE/GeorgiaStrategy.pdf> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- German, Tracey. (2015). Heading west? Georgia's Euro-Atlantic path. *International Affairs* 91(3): 601–14.
- Gerrits, Andre W. & Bader, Max. (2016). Russian patronage over Abkhazia and South Ossetia: implications for conflict resolution. *East European Politics* 32(3): 297–313.
- Gogoladze, Tina. (2019). *Hate Speech 2018*. Tbilisi: Media Development Foundation.
- Goksel, Nigar. (2013). Turkey and Georgia: Zero-problems? *On Wider Europe*(June): 1–8.
- Goksel, Nigar. (2011). Turkish policy towards the Caucasus: A Balance Sheet of the Balancing Act. *Black Sea Discussion Paper Series*(1): 1–26.
- Göl, Ayla. (2005). Imagining the Turkish nation through 'othering' Armenians. *Nations and Nationalism* 11(1): 121–39.
- Grzelidze, Tamara. (2010). The Orthodox Church of Georgia: challenges under democracy and freedom (1990–2009). *International journal for the Study of the Christian Church* 10(2-3): 160–75.
- Gurchiani, Ketevan. (2017). How Soviet is the religious revival in Georgia: Tactics in everyday religiosity. *Europe-Asia Studies* 69(3): 508–31.
- Hagström, Linus & Gustafsson, Karl. (2015). Japan and identity change: why it matters in International Relations. *The Pacific Review* 28(1): 1–22.
- Halbach, Uwe. (2016). Religion und Nation, Kirche und Staat im Südkaukasus. *SWP-Studie* 18(Okttober): pp. 1–35.
- Hansen, Lene. (2006). *Security as practice: Discourse analysis and the Bosnian war*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Ingebritsen, Christine. (2002). Norm Entrepreneurs: Scandinavia's Role in World Politics. *Cooperation and Conflict* 37(1): 11–23.
- Ivanov, Vladimir. (2011). Religious Dimension of Turkey's Policy in Ajaria and the Georgian Orthodox Church. *Central Asia and the Caucasus* 12(3): 79–90.
- Jam News. (2020). *Could Georgia lose international support? Another critical letter from Washington*, <https://jam-news.net/could-georgia-lose-international-support-another-critical-letter-from-washington/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Jensen, Sune Q. (2011). Othering, identity formation and agency. *Qualitative Studies* 2(2): 63–78.
- Jones, Stephen. (2004). The Role of Cultural Paradigms in Georgian Foreign Policy. In *Ideology and National Identity in Post-Communist Foreign Policy*, Fawn, Rick (ed). London: Cass, 81–108.
- Jørgensen, Marianne. & Phillips, Louise. (2002). *Discourse Analysis As Theory and Method*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Kabachnik, Peter. (2018). The power of place, or powerless places? Hybrid attitudes towards Soviet symbols in post-Soviet Georgia. *Central Asian Survey* 37(2): 265–85.
- Kakabadze, Shota & Makarychev, Andrey. (2018). A Tale of Two Orthodoxies: Europe in Religious Discourses of Russia and Georgia. *Ethnopolitics* 17(5): 485–502.
- Kakachia, Kornely, Minesashvili, Salome & Kakhishvili, Levan. (2018). Change and Continuity in the Foreign Policies of Small States: Elite Perceptions and Georgia's Foreign Policy Towards Russia: Elite perceptions and Georgia's foreign policy towards Russia. *Europe-Asia Studies* 70(5): 814–31.
- Kakachia, Kornely & Minesashvili, Salome. (2015). Identity politics: Exploring Georgian foreign policy behavior. *Journal of Eurasian Studies* 6(2): 171–80.

- Kakachia, Kornely. (2014). Is Georgia's Orthodox church an obstacle to European values? *Ponars Eurasia Policy Memo* 322(June): 1–6.
- Kakachia, Kornely. (2012). Georgia's identity-driven foreign policy and the struggle for its European destiny. *Caucasus Analytical Digest* 37(March): 4–7.
- Ker-Lindsay, James & Berg, Eiki. (2018). Introduction: A Conceptual Framework for Engagement with de facto States. *Ethnopolitics* 17(4): 335–42.
- Khalvashi, Tamta. (2015). *Peripheral affects: Shame, publics, and performance on the margins of the republic of Georgia*. Copenhagen: Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Copenhagen.
- Khalvashi, Tamta. (2012). Can Muslim be a Georgian?: Historic Overview of Discourse on Georgian 'Essence'. In *Central Eurasian studies. Past, present and future*, Komatsu, Hisao (ed), T.C. Maltepe Üniversitesi yayınları. Istanbul: Maltepe Universität.
- Khelashvili, George. (2012). Holding the Line amid Uncertainty. *Caucasus Analytical Digest* 37(March): 8-10.
- Khutsishvili, Kristina. (2018). Myself and the Other: Competitive Narratives of Georgians and Abkhazians. *Region* 7(1): 69–82.
- Kiniklioğlu, Suat. (2004). Turkish-Georgian Relations: An Interview with Georgian President Mikhail Sankashvili. *Insight Turkey* 6(2): 45–48.
- Kononczuk, Wojciech. (2008). A Caucasian ally? Turkish-Georgian relations. In *Turkey after the start of negotiations with the European Union - foreign relations and the domestic situation*, Balcer, Adam (ed). Warsaw: CES Report, 31–40.
- Kopeček, Vincenc, Hoch, Tomáš & Baar, Vladimír. (2016). De Facto States and Democracy: The Case of Abkhazia. *Bulletin of Geography. Socio-economic Series* 32(32): 85–104.
- Ladaria, Konstantine. (2002). Georgian Orthodox Church and Political Project of Modernization. *Identity Studies* 4): 107–17.
- Leonardis, Fabio d. (2016). Memory and Nation-Building in Georgia. In *Nation-building and identity in the post-Soviet space. New tools and approaches*, Isaacs, Rico & Polese, Abel (eds), *Post-Soviet Politics*. London, New York, NY: Routledge Imprint of Taylor & Francis Group, 24–45.
- Lindgren, Wrenn Y. & Lindgren, Petter Y. (2017). Identity Politics and the East China Sea: China as Japan's 'Other'. *Asian Politics & Policy* 9(3): 378–401.
- Lindstrom, Nicole. (2003). Between Europe and the Balkans: Mapping Slovenia and Croatia's "Return to Europe" in the 1990s. *Dialectical Anthropology* 27): 313–29.
- Machaidze, Rusudan. (2019). *Tbilisi protests – what they mean and what to expect*, <https://jam-news.net/tbilisi-protests-what-this-means-and-what-to-expect/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Makarychev, Andrey & Yatsyk, Alexandra. (2017). Biopolitical conservatism and "pastoral power": a Russia – Georgia meeting point. In *Religion and Soft Power in the South Caucasus. Policy Perspective*, Georgian Institute of Politics (ed). Tbilisi.
- Mamadouh, Virginie & Bialasiewicz, Luiza. (2016). Introduction to the Special Issue: Europe and its Others. *Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie* 107(2): 129–33.
- Mikeladze, Tamta. (2013). *Crisis of Secularism and Loyalty towards the Dominant Group: The Role of the Government in the 2012-2013 Religious Conflicts in Georgia*. Tbilisi: Human Rights Education and Monitoring Center (EMC).
- Mindiashvili, Beka. (2012). *Pre-election Turkophobia*, <http://www.tabula.ge/en/story/70462-pre-election-turkophobia> (accessed 27 June 2020).

- Minesashvili, Salome. (2017a). Foreign Policy of the Georgian Orthodox Church: Interplay between the West and Russia. In *Religion and Soft Power in the South Caucasus. Policy Perspective*, Georgian Institute of Politics (ed). Tbilisi, 17–24.
- Minesashvili, Salome. (2017b). The Orthodox Church in the Democratization Process in Georgia: Hindrance or Support? *Caucasus Analytical Digest* 97(July): 6-9.
- Mühlfried, Florian. (2015). Religion, Reinheit und Radikalisierung. Vom Ende des Alaverdoba-Fests in Georgien. *Osteuropa* 65(7-10): 587–98.
- Nakhutsrishvili, Luka & Lejava, Nino. (2018). Einleitung. In *Georgien, neu buchstabiert. Politik und Kultur eines Landes auf dem Weg nach Europa*, Nakhutsrishvili, Luka & Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung (eds), Edition Kulturwissenschaft. Bielefeld: Transcript, 9–20.
- Neumann, Iver B. (1999). *Uses of the Other: "The East" in European identity formation*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Nodia, Ghia. (2017). *Democracy and its deficits: The path towards becoming European-style democracies in Georgia, Moldova and Ukraine*: CEPS Working Documents 12.
- O'Loughlin, John, Toal, Gerard & Kolosov, Vladimir. (2017). Who identifies with the "Russian World"? Geopolitical attitudes in southeastern Ukraine, Crimea, Abkhazia, South Ossetia, and Transnistria. *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 57(6): 1–34.
- Oskanian, Kevork. (2016). The Balance Strikes Back: Power, perceptions, and ideology in Georgian foreign policy, 1992–2014. *Foreign Policy Analysis* 2(0): 1–25.
- Oskanian, Kevork. (2014). Balancing a tightrope: Constraints, possibilities and ideology in Georgian foreign policy, 1991-2014.: Paper presented at the 2014 UACES Conference, Cork/Ireland.
- Pelkmans, Mathijs. (2003). Shifting frontiers: Islam and Christianity in post-Soviet Ajaria. *ISIM Newsletter* 12(June): 46–47.
- Pelkmans, Mathijs. (1999). The wounded body: Reflections on the demise of the 'Iron Curtain' between Georgia and Turkey. *Anthropology of East Europe Review* 17(1): 49–58.
- Reisner, Oliver. (2015). Sakral-national Orthodoxer Glaube und Orthodoxe Kirche in Georgien. *Osteuropa* 65(7-10): 93–112.
- Risse, Thomas. (2017). *Domestic politics and norm diffusion in international relations: Ideas do not float freely*. London, New York NY: Routledge.
- Roehrs-Weist, Philip. (2018). *Thomas de Waal: NATO membership is not necessarily essential for Georgia*, <http://caucasuswatch.de/news/1154.html> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Rumelili, Bahar. (2004). Constructing identity and relating to difference: understanding the EU's mode of differentiation. *Review of International Studies* 30(1): 27–47.
- Russo, Alessandra. (2018). *Regions in Transition in the Former Soviet Area*. Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Sadigbeyli, Rovshan. (2002). Stability in the South Caucasus: The role of Russia and Turkey. Master thesis, Bilkent University Ankara.
- Sanikidze, George & Walker, Edward W. (2004). *Islam and Islamic Practices in Georgia*, <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/7149d486> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Siroky, David S., Simmons, Alan J. & Gvalia, Giorgi. (2017). Vodka or Bourbon? Foreign policy preferences toward Russia and the United States in Georgia. *Foreign Policy Analysis* 13): 500–18.

- Smolnik, Franziska, Weiss, Andrea & Zabanova, Yana. (2018). Political space and borderland practices in Abkhazia and Adjara: Exploring the role of Ottoman legacies and contemporary Turkish influences. *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 58(5): 557–81.
- Staszak, Jean F. (2009). Other/Otherness. In *International encyclopedia of human geography*, Kitchin, Rob & Thrift, Nigel J. (eds). Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Storm, Karli. (2019). Flexible Memory Narratives in the Physical Landscape: A Case Study of Tbilisi, Georgia. *Demokratizatsiya: The Journal of Post-Soviet Democratization* 27(2): 131–62.
- Szkola, Susanne. (2018). The Self/Other Space and Spinning the Net of Ontological Insecurities in Ukraine and Beyond: (Discursive) Reconstructions of Boundaries in the EU Eastern Partnership Countries Vis-à-Vis the EU and Russia. In *Crisis and Change in Post-Cold War Global Politics*, Resende, Erica, Budryté, Dovyłé & Buhari-Gulmez, Didem (eds). Cham: Springer International Publishing, 225–50.
- Szkola, Susanne. (2017). 'Discursive reconstructions of boundaries in the South Caucasus countries vis-à-vis the EU and Russia and the crux of securitization. *UPTAKE Working Paper* 5.
- The Caucasus Research Resource Center. (2019a). *Main Enemy of the Country*, <https://caucasusbarometer.org/en/cb2019ge/MAINENEM/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- The Caucasus Research Resource Center. (2019b). *Main Friend of the Country*, <https://caucasusbarometer.org/en/cb2019ge/MAINFRN/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- The Caucasus Research Resource Center. (2019c). *Trust - Religious Institutions Respondent Belongs to*, <https://caucasusbarometer.org/en/cb2019ge/TRURELI/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Timofeev, Ivan. (2017). *Working Under the Radar: The Stealth Alternative in Russia's Foreign Policy*, <http://russiancouncil.ru/en/analytcs-and-comments/analytcs/working-under-the-radar-the-stealth-alternative-in-russia-s-foreign-policy-/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Toal, Gerard & O'Loughlin, John. (2014). *How people in South Ossetia, Abkhazia and Transnistria feel about annexation by Russia*, <http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/monkey-cage/wp/2014/03/20/how-people-in-south-ossetia-abkhazia-and-transnistria-feel-about-annexation-by-russia/> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Tsagareishvili, Nino. (2015). *Freedom of Religion in Georgia: Problems and Recommendations*. Tbilisi: Human Rights Center.
- Tsintsiladze, Inga. (2019). European Integration and Identity Issues in Georgia. *Eastern Europe-Regional Studies*.
- Waal, Thomas de. (2010). *The Caucasus: An introduction*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Waal, Thomas de. (2008). *South Ossetia: the avoidable tragedy*, <https://www.opendemocracy.net/article/south-ossetia-the-avoidable-tragedy> (accessed 27 June 2020).
- Weiss, Andrea & Zabanova, Yana. (2016). Georgia and Abkhazia caught between Turkey and Russia.: Turkey's changing relations with Russia and the West in 2015–2016 and their impact on Georgia and Abkhazia. *SWP-Comments* 54(December): 1–8.
- Wendt, Alexander. (1994). Collective Identity Formation and the International State. *American Political Science Review* 88(2): 384–96.
- Wivel, Anders. (2016). Living on the edge: Georgian foreign policy between the West and the rest. *Third World Thematics* 1(1): 92–109.

Zviadadze, Sophie. (2015). Georgian Orthodox church and human rights: Challenges to Georgian society. In *Religion and Human Rights*, Ziebertz, Hans-Georg & Črpić, Gordan (eds). Cham: Springer International Publishing, 45–60.