

ИССЛЕДОВАНИЕ ОНЛАЙНОВОГО ЯЗЫКА ВРАЖДЫ ПО ОТНОШЕНИЮ К РОМСКОМУ МЕНЬШИНСТВУ В УКРАИНСКОМ ИНТЕРНЕТ-ПРОСТРАНСТВЕ

Ольга Кислова

Харьковский национальный университет имени В. Н. Каразина
ORCID: 0000-0003-2241-1313

Ирина Кузина

Харьковский национальный университет имени В. Н. Каразина
ORCID: 0000-0003-0243-2926

Ирина Дырда

Харьковский национальный университет имени В. Н. Каразина
<https://doi.org/10.36169/2227-6068.2020.01.00021>

Резюме. *Статья посвящена исследованию онлайн-языка вражды по отношению к ромскому меньшинству и, одновременно, изучению эвристических возможностей современных аналитических инструментов.*

Исследование показало, что ромская тематика мало интересует рядовых пользователей социальных сетей, следовательно, и язык вражды по отношению к ромам в отечественном сетевом пространстве не является распространенным явлением: 1) в Facebook найдено только одну достаточно большую публичную группу на украинском языке, которая касается ромов и содержит язык вражды по отношению к ним; 2) из всех сообщений Twitter, созданных пользователями из Украины в течение марта-сентября 2018 года, только 80 постов касаются ромов (цыган), при этом 45 из них содержат язык вражды.

Анализ содержания сообщений Facebook и Twitter продемонстрировал, что механизмы формирования языка вражды по отношению к ромам в онлайн-среде остаются неизменными: стигматизация, где стигмой выступает национальная принадлежность; распространение негативно окрашенных стереотипов, опасений и предубеждений; подчеркивание «инаковости». Каналами распространения языка вражды в социальных сетях являются локальные автономные группы, которые обычно создаются одним автором и впоследствии, если публикации вызывают интерес аудитории, могут превратиться в «рупор ненависти». Главным отличием онлайн-языка вражды от офлайн-языка является возможность быстрого распространения: лишь несколько ненавистнических высказываний, которые многократно тиражируются в комментариях последователей, могут нанести значительный ущерб и привести к преступлениям в реальной жизни.

Апробация возможностей имеющихся инструментов добычи и анализа данных социальных сетей показал, что они позволяют исследователям изымать данные из социальных сетей и использовать их в качестве эмпирической базы социологических исследований. Однако исследования онлайн-языка вражды в украинском

интернет-пространстве затрудняется в связи со сложностями семантического анализа, обусловленными, прежде всего тем, что в украиноязычном пространстве нет словарей-маркеров для идентификации языка вражды и несовершенством инструментов для анализа текстов, в том числе коммерческих.

Степень распространенности языка вражды мы предлагаем рассматривать как социальный сигнал интернета о состоянии общества, в частности, как индикатор уровня генерализованного доверия, который, по нашему мнению, является функцией социальной среды, а не только характеристикой личности.

Ключевые слова: язык вражды, онлайн-язык вражды, ромское меньшинство, большие данные, генерализованное доверие, инструменты извлечения языка вражды

Полнотекстовая версия статьи доступна на украинском языке.

Бibliография:

- Alba, Davey. (2017). Defining “hate speech” online is an imperfect art. *WIRED*, <https://www.wired.com/story/defining-hate-speech-online-is-imperfect-art-as-much-as-science/> (accessed 29 January 2020).
- Azhnyuk, Lesya. (2017). Linhvistychna parametryzatsiya movnoho zlochynu: metodolohichni pidkhody [from Ukr.: Linguistic parameters of the language crime: methodological approaches]. *Mova i suspil'stvo* [from Ukr.: Language and Society], 8: 33-46, <http://publications.lnu.edu.ua/collections/index.php/ls/article/view/1770> (accessed 15 July 2020).
- Balkin 2017 Balkin, Jack M. (2017). Free Speech in the Algorithmic Society: Big Data, Private Governance, and New School Speech. *UCDL Rev.*, 51: 1149, https://lawreview.law.ucdavis.edu/issues/51/3/Essays/51-3_Balkin.pdf (accessed 31 January 2020).
- Balkin, Jack M. (2017). Free Speech in the Algorithmic Society: Big Data, Private Governance, and New School Speech. *UCDL Rev.*, 51: 1149, https://lawreview.law.ucdavis.edu/issues/51/3/Essays/51-3_Balkin.pdf (accessed 31 January 2020).
- Bojarska, Katarzyna. (2018). The dynamics of hate speech and counter speech in the social media. Summary of scientific research. *Centre for the Internet and Human Rights*, https://cihr.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/The-dynamics-of-hate-speech-and-counter-speech-in-the-social-media_English-1.pdf (accessed 27 January 2020).
- Burnap, Pete & Williams, Matthew. (2015). Cyber Hate Speech on Twitter: An Application of Machine Classification and Statistical Modeling for Policy and Decision Making. *Policy & Internet*, <https://orca.cf.ac.uk/73158/1/Burnap%20%2526%20Williams%202015.pdf> (accessed 22 January 2020).
- Chernenko, Hanna. (2015). Vidy movy vorozhnechi za typom styhmatyzovanoho ob'yekta v suchasnomu ukrayins'komu suspil'stvi [from Ukr.: Types of hate speech by type of stigmatized object in modern Ukrainian society]. *Aktual'ni problemy ukrayins'koyi linhvistyky: teoriya i praktyka* [from Ukr.: Topical issues of Ukrainian linguistics: theory and practice], 30, 35-45, http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/apyl_2015_30_5 (accessed 10 July 2020).

- Dehtyar'ova, Halyna. (2019). Mova vorozhnechi yak vvyav informatsiynoyi ahresiyyi v suspil'stvi ta shlyakhy yiyi podolannya [from Ukr.: Hate speech as a manifestation of information aggression in society and ways to overcome it]. *Sotsial'no-humanitarni nauky. Pol's'ko-ukrayins'kyy naukovyy zhurnal* [from Ukr.: Social and humanitarian sciences. Polish-Ukrainian Scientific Journal], 2 (22), https://sp-sciences.io.ua/s2650847/dehtiarova_halyna_2019_.the_hate_speech_as_a_manifestation_of_information_aggression_in_the_society_and_the_ways_to_overcome_it_social_and_human_sciences_polish-ukrainian_scientific_journal_02_22_ (accessed 21 January 2020).
- Dibrivna, Eleonora & Kukharchuk, Ruslan. (2017). "Mova vorozhnechi" yak tавro i tsenzura. Yevropeys'kyy kontekst [from Ukr.: "Hate speech" as a brand and censorship. European context]. *Ukrayins'ka Pravda*, 22 veresnya 2017 [from Ukr.: Ukrainian Pravda, September 22, 2017], <https://www.pravda.com.ua/columns/2017/09/22/7155975/> (accessed 29 January 2020).
- Enarsson, Therese & Lindgren, Simon. (2019). Free speech or hate speech? A legal analysis of the discourse about Roma on Twitter. *Information & Communications Technology Law*, 28 (1): 1-18, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13600834.2018.1494415> (accessed 21 January 2020).
- Freitag, Markus & Traummuller, Richard. (2009). Spheres of trust: An empirical analysis of the foundations of particularised and generalised trust. *European Journal of Political Research*, 48(6): 782–803, <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.864.312&rep=rep1&type=pdf> (accessed 05 February 2020).
- Future Now. (2019). Naypopulyarnishi sotsial'ni merezhi svitu (2019) ta reytynh Ukrayiny [from Ukr.: The most popular social networks in the world (2019) and the rating of Ukraine]. Future Now. <https://futurenow.com.ua/21-najpopulyarnishyh-sotsialnyh-merezh-svitu-ta-rejtyng-ukrayiny/> (accessed 14 July 2020).
- Gagliardone, Iginio. (2014). Mapping and Analysing Hate Speech Online. *SSRN*, <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2601792> (accessed 21 January 2020).
- Gimmeson, Linda. (2015). Combating Crime and Hate Speech with Big Data. *Big Data Zone*, <https://dzone.com/articles/combating-crime-and-hate> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Heyza, Adam. (2013). Kontseptsiya vyrishennya problem roma v yevropeys'komu konteksti [from Ukr.: The concept of solving Roma problems in the European context]. *Romolohiya: istoriya ta suchasnist'. Materialy Mizhnarodnykh naukovykh chytan'* [from Ukr.: Romology: history and modernity. Materials of International scientific readings]. Uzhhorod: Polygraph Center "Lira", 40–56, <https://www.uzhnu.edu.ua/uk/infocentre/get/2812> (accessed 20 January, 2020).
- Horbachova, Ol'ha. (2008). Mova vorozhnechi: ksenofobiya chy bezladnist' [from Ukr.: Hate speech: xenophobia or disorder]. *Pravyi ekstremizm i tolerantnist': z dosvidu Ukrayiny ta Nimechchyny* [Right-wing extremism and tolerance: from the experience of Ukraine and Germany]. Kyiv: Zapovit: 36-42, <https://library.fees.de/pdf-files/bueros/ukraine/06708.pdf> (accessed 31 January 2020).
- Howard, Jeffrey W. (2019). Free speech and hate speech. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 22: 93-109, <https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/10.1146/annurev-polisci-051517-012343> (accessed 29 January 2020).
- Hromads'kyy Prostir. (06.09.2019). Naybil'she movy vorozhnechi v onlayn-ZMI Kharkova, Zaporizhzhya ta Chernivtsiv: doslidzhennya IMI [from Ukr.: The most hate speech is in the online media of Kharkiv, Zaporizhia and Chernivtsi: IMI research], <https://www.prostir.ua/?news=najbilshemovy-vorozhnechi-v-onlajn-zmi-harkova-zaporizhzhya-ta-chernivtsiv-doslidzhennya-imi> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Isakova, Tamara. (2016). Mova vorozhnechi yak problema ukrayins'koho informatsiynoho prostoru [from Ukr.: Hate speech as a problem of the Ukrainian information space]. *Stratehichni priorytety. Seriya: Polityka* [from Ukr.: Strategic priorities. Series: Politics], 4, 90-97, <http://ippi.org.ua/sites/default/files/isakova.pdf> (accessed 27 January 2020).

- Kostovs'ka, Alla. (2017). From hate speech to language of understanding: current issues [from Ukr.: The concept and features of hate speech: civil aspects]. *Mova i kul'tura* [from Ukr.: Language and Culture], 114-121, https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Hanna_ganna_Anna_Onkovych/publication/334001218_Konferencia_Mova_i_kultura_ak_interaktivna_mediaosvitna_tehnologia/links/5d1260b3299bf1547c7f2f19/Konferencia-Mova-i-kultura-ak-interaktivna-mediaosvitna-tehnologia.pdf#page=114 (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Kozhevnikova, Galina (2007). Yazyk vrazhdy posle Kondopogi [from Rus.: Hate speech after Kondopoga]. *Yzyk vrazhdy protiv obshchestva* [from Rus.: Hate speech against society]. Moscow: SOVA Center, 10-72, http://www.diversipedia.org.ua/sites/default/files/sova_hate_speech.pdf (accessed 27 January 2020).
- Kroz, Mikhail & Ratinova, Natal'ya. (2005). Ekspertnaya otsenka materialov, napravlennykh na vzbuzhdeniye vrazhdy i nenavisti [from Rus.: Expert assessment of materials aimed at inciting hostility and hatred]. *Tsena nenavisti* [from Rus.: The price of hate]. Moscow: SOVA Center, 2005, 75-92, <https://www.sova-center.ru/files/books/cn05-text.pdf> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Kuzina, Iryna. (2015). Dovira do politychnykh institutiv v Ukraini: kontseptualizatsiya fenomenu ta faktory formuvannya [dys.kand.sotsiol.nauk] [from Ukr.: Trust in political institutions in Ukraine: conceptualization of the phenomenon and factors of formation (PhD thesis)], <http://dissertations.karazin.ua/sociology/resources/2b73e117fd1597d804af05a2a81a527c.pdf> (accessed 02 February 2020).
- Kyslova, Olga. (2015). Sotsyolohyya v kontekste vyzova «bol'shykh dannykh»: rol' yntellektual'noho analiza dannykh v stanovleny novykh podkhodov k sotsyolohycheskym yssledovanyam [from Rus.: Sociology in the context of the challenge of "big data": the role of intelligent data analysis in the formation of new approaches to sociological research]. *Visnyk Kharkivs'koho natsional'noho universytetu imeni V. N. Karazina. Seriya «Sotsiolohichni doslidzhennya suchasnoho suspil'stva: metodolohiya, teoriya, metody»* [from Ukr.: Bulletin of V.N. Karazin Kharkiv National University "Sociological research of modern society: methodology, theory, methods"], 1148: 57-62, <http://dspace.univer.kharkov.ua/handle/123456789/11349> (accessed 30 January 2020).
- Kyslova, Olga. (2019). Velyki dani v konteksti doslidzhennya problem suchasnoho suspil'stva [from Ukr.: Big data in the context of research of problems of modern society], *Visnyk Kharkivs'koho natsional'noho universytetu imeni V. N. Karazina. Seriya «Sotsiolohichni doslidzhennya suchasnoho suspil'stva: metodolohiya, teoriya, metody»* [from Ukr.: Bulletin of V.N. Karazin Kharkiv National University. Series "Sociological research of modern society: methodology, theory, methods"], 42(-): 59-68, doi: 10.26565/2227-6521-2019-42-06 (accessed 30 January 2020).
- L'vova, Olena. (2018). Mova vorozhnechi: teoretyko-pravovyy analiz ponyattya [from Ukr.: Hate speech: theoretical and legal analysis of the concept]. *Pravova derzhava* [from Ukr.: Constitutional state], 29, 71-79.
- Laaksonen, Salla-Maaria., Haapoja, Jesse., Kinnunen, Teemu, Nelimarkka, Matti & Pöyhtäri, Reeta. (2020). The Datafication of Hate: Expectations and Challenges in Automated Hate Speech Monitoring. *Frontiers in Big Data*. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fdata.2020.00003> (accessed 15 July 2020).
- Leptuha, Olena. (2019). «Mova vorozhnechi» v ukrayinomovnomu mediaprostori [from Ukr.: "Hate speech" in the Ukrainian-language media space]. *Visnyk Naukovo-metodychnoho tsentru navchal'nykh zakladiv sfery tsyvil'noho zakhystu* [from Ukr.: Bulletin of the Scientific and Methodological Center for Educational Institutions in the Field of Civil Defense], 31, 11-12, <http://repositsc.nuczu.edu.ua/bitstream/123456789/10579/1/%D0%92%D1%96%D1%81%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%BA%20%D0%9D%D0%9C%D0%A6%2031-%D1%81%D1%82%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%BD%D0%B8%D1%86%D1%8B-11-12.pdf> (accessed 10 July 2020).

- Lombardo, Flavia. (2018). Hate speech and big data: The ODyCCEuS project. *Ca' Foscari News*, 19.10.2018, https://www.unive.it/pag/16584/?tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=5957&cHash=30a324c9b68815c7d01e9207b4d6ccdd (accessed 30 January 2020).
- Lykhova, S. & Rybal'chenko, H. (2013). Mova vorozhnechi yak oznaka porushennya rivnopravnosti hromadyan zalezno vid yikh rasovoyi, natsional'noyi nalezhnosti abo stavlennya do relihiyi [from Ukr.: Hate speech as a sign of violation of equality of citizens depending on their race, nationality or religion]. *Aktual'ni problemy vdoskonalennya chynnoho zakonodavstva Ukrayiny* [from Ukr.: Current issues of improving the current legislation of Ukraine], 31: 274-282, <https://journals.pnu.edu.ua/index.php/apiclu/article/view/706/765> (accessed 05 February 2020).
- MediaSapiens. (July 9, 2020). Facebook vydaliv bil'she sotni ukrayin'skykh akauntiv cherez politahitatsiyu ta movu nenavysti [from Ukr.: Facebook deleted more than a hundred Ukrainian accounts due to political agitation and hate speech], <https://ms.detector.media/sotsmerezhi/post/25024/2020-07-09-facebook-vidaliv-bil'she-sotni-ukrainskikh-akauntiv-cherez-politagitatsiyu-ta-movu-nenavysti/> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- MediaSapiens. (September 8, 2015). Doslidzhennya «Praktyka vykorystannya "movy vorozhnechi" (hate speech) ukrayin'skymy ZMI» [from Ukr.: Research "The practice of using "hate speech" by the Ukrainian media"], <https://ms.detector.media/mediadoslidzhennya/post/14140/2015-09-08-doslidzhennya-praktika-vikoristannya-movi-vorozhnechi-hate-speech-ukrainskimi-zmi/> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Medvedyeva, Maryna, Dibrivna, Eleonora & Kukharchuk, Ruslan. (2017). «Mova nenavysti» v mizhnarodnomu ta yevropeys'komu Pravovomu konteksti [from Ukr.: "Hate speech" in the international and European legal context], *Aktual'ni problemy mizhnarodnykh vidnosyn* [from Ukr.: Current issues of international relations], 133: 95-105, <http://apir.iir.edu.ua/index.php/apmv/article/download/3229/2902/> (accessed 27 January 2020).
- Medyn'ska, Olesya & Synorub, Halyna. (2018). Mova vorozhnechi u vyborchomu dyskursi (za materialamy onlayn-vydan' «Ukrayins'ka pravda», «Dzerkalo tyzhnya», «Vil'ne zhyttya plyus» ta informatsiynoho ahent-stva «Rubryka») [from Ukr.: Hate speech in the election discourse (based on the materials of the online publications "Ukrainian Truth", "Mirror of the Week", "Free Life Plus" and the news agency "Rubric")]. *Naukovi zapysky Ternopil's'koho natsional'noho pedahohichnoho universytetu imeni Volodymyra Hnatyuka. Ser. Movoznavstvo* [from Ukr.: Scientific notes of Ternopil National Pedagogical University named after Volodymyr Hnatyuk. Series Linguistics], 2 (30), 55-61, http://dspace.tnpu.edu.ua/bitstream/123456789/15178/1/10_Medynska_Synorub.pdf (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Miskolci, Jozef, Kováčová, Lucia & Rigová, Edita. (2018). Countering Hate Speech on Facebook: The Case of the Roma Minority in Slovakia. *Social Science Computer Review*, DOI: 10.1177/0894439318791786 (accessed 31 January 2020).
- Pacheco, Edgar & Melhuish, Neil. (2018). Online hate speech: a survey on personal experiences and exposure among adult New Zealanders, *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 5, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329379590_Online_hate_speech_A_survey_on_personal_experiences_and_exposure_among_adult_New_Zealanders (accessed 15 July 2020).
- Panina, Nataliya, & Golovakha, Yevgeniy. (2006). Natsional'naya tolerantnost' i identichnost' v Ukraine: opyt primeneniya shkaly sotsial'noy distantsii v monitoringovom sotsiologicheskoy issledovanii [from Rus.: National Tolerance and Identity in Ukraine: Experience of Applying the Social Distance Scale in Monitoring Sociological Research]. *Sotsiologicheskii zhurnal* [from Rus.: Sociological journal]. № 3/4, 102 – 126, <https://www.jour.fnisc.ru/index.php/socjour/article/view/920/874> (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Panina, Nataliya. (2002). Natsional'na tolerantnist', natsional'nyy izolyatsionizm ta ksenofobiya v Ukrayini [from Ukr.: National tolerance, national isolationism and xenophobia in Ukraine]. *Monitorynh*

- sotsial'nykh zmin [from Ukr.: Monitoring of social changes]. K.: Instytut sotsiologiyi NAN Ukrainy [from Ukr.: Kyiv: Institute of Sociology of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine], 445-459.
- Paniotto, Volodymyr. (2019). Mizhethnichni uperedzhennya v Ukraini [from Ukr.: Interethnic prejudices in Ukraine]. *Kyyivs'kyi mizhnarodnyy instytut sotsiologiyi (KMIS)* [from Ukr.: Kyiv International Institute of Sociology (KIIS)], 7.11.2019, <https://www.kiis.com.ua/?lang=ukr&cat=reports&id=904&page=1> (accessed 20 January, 2020).
- Polyuzhyn, Mykhaylo. (2015). Ponyattya, kontsept ta yoho struktura [from Ukr.: Notion, concept and its structure]. *Naukovyy visnyk Skhidnoyevropeys'koho natsional'noho universytetu imeni Lesi Ukrainky. Filolohichni nauky. Movoznavstvo* [from Ukr.: Scientific Bulletin of the Lesia Ukrainka East European National University. Philological sciences. Linguistics], 4 : 212-222, <https://rgf.eenu.edu.ua/index.php/rgf/article/view/253> (accessed 24 January 2020).
- Pribytkova, Nataliya. (2017). Kharakterystyka kul'turno-psykholohichnykh faktoriv poshyrennya rasyzmu ta ksenofobiyi [from Ukr.: Characteristics of cultural and psychological factors of racism and xenophobia]. *Visnyk Kharkivs'koho natsional'noho universytetu vnutrishnikh sprav* [from Ukr.: Bulletin of Kharkiv National University of Internal Affairs], 3, 80-88, http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/VKhnvvs_2017_3_14 (accessed 13 July 2020).
- Ring, Caitlin Elizabeth. (2013). Hate Speech in Social Media: An Exploration of the Problem and Its Proposed Solutions. *Journalism & Mass Communication Graduate Theses & Dissertations, 15*, https://scholar.colorado.edu/concern/graduate_thesis_or_dissertations/12579s395 (accessed 21 January 2020).
- Samokysh, Ihor. (2017). Mova vorozhnechi ta yak yiy protydiyaty [from Ukr.: Hate speech and how to counteract it]. *Derzhava ta rehiony. Seriya «Sotsial'ni komunikatsiyi»* [from Ukr.: State and Regions. Series "Social Communications"], 4: 182-185, http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/drsk_2017_4_34 (accessed 10 July 2020).
- Seligmen, Adam. (2002). Problema doveriya [from Rus.: The problem of trust]. Moscow: Ideya-Press.
- SELMA. (2019). Hacking Online Hate: Building an Evidence Base for Educators. *School Education Gateway*, <https://hackinghate.eu/assets/documents/hacking-online-hate-research-report-1.pdf> (accessed 31 January 2020).
- Smirnov, Heorhiy. (2016). Ponyattya ta osoblyvosti movy vorozhnechi: tsyvil'no-pravovi aspekty [from Ukr.: The concept and features of hate speech: civil aspects]. *Chasopys Kyyivs'koho universytetu prava* [from Ukr.: Journal of Kyiv University of Law], 2, 403-406.
- Soroka, Yuliya. (2018) Mova vorozhnechi v perspektyvi sotsiologiyi kul'tury [from Ukr.: Hate speech in the perspective of sociology of culture]. *Sotsiologiya: teoriya, metody, marketynh* [from Ukr.: Sociology: theory, methods, marketing], 3: 25-46, <http://stmm.in.ua/archive/ukr/2018-3/4.pdf> (accessed 21 January 2020).
- Sychev, Andrey, Zhadunova, Natal'ya & Koval', Yekaterina. (2018). Problema klassifikatsii yazyka vrazhdy v otnoshenii migrantov (na primere Respubliki Mordoviya) [from Rus.: The Issue of Classification of Hate Speech Against Migrants (the Case Study of the Republic of Mordovia)]. *Regionologiya* [from Rus.: Regionology], 26(4), 798-815, <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/problema-klassifikatsii-yazyka-vrazhdy-v-otnoshenii-migrantov-na-primere-respubliki-mordoviya> (accessed 14 July 2020)
- Ullmann, S. & Tomalin, M. (2019). Quarantining online hate speech: technical and ethical perspectives. *Ethics and Information Technology*, 1-12. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10676-019-09516-z> (accessed 22 January 2020).
- Verkhovskiy, Aleksandr (2005). Ot sostavitelya. *Tsena nenavisti* [from Rus.: From the originator. The price of hate]. Moscow: SOVA Center, 5-11, <https://www.sova-center.ru/files/books/cn05-text.pdf> (accessed 27 January 2020).
- Verkhovskiy, Aleksandr (2007). Ot sostavitelya. *Yazyk vrazhdy protiv obshchestva* [from Rus.: From the originator. Hate speech against society]. Moscow: SOVA Center, 5-10,

http://www.diversipedia.org.ua/sites/default/files/sova_hate_speech.pdf (accessed 27 January 2020).

Waldron, Jeremy. (2012). *The Harm in Hate Speech*. Cambridge, MA; London.

Zinevych, Nataliya. (2017). Etnonimy romy, tsyhany v suchasnomu ukrayins'komu naukovomu diskursi [from Ukr.: Ethnonyms Roma, Gypsies in modern Ukrainian scientific discourse]. *Romagenocide*, [http://romagenocide.com.ua/data/files/Zinevych\(1\).pdf](http://romagenocide.com.ua/data/files/Zinevych(1).pdf) (accessed 24 January 2020).